Identifying Implementation Considerations Using Patient-Oriented Research

Masterclass on the Conduct and Use of Patient-Oriented Research
Toronto, ON, Canada

John N. Lavis, MD, PhD
Professor and Director, McMaster Health Forum
McMaster University

Anne Lyddiatt
Patient Partners in Arthritis Program

1

Objectives for this Session

- To appreciate
    - Questions to ask about implementation considerations
    - Types of research evidence needed to answer these questions (and related research terminology)
    - Appropriate sources of key types of pre-appraised research evidence
- To understand the importance of
    - Working iteratively to understand implementation considerations
    - Being systematic and transparent in finding and using research evidence as one input to the decision-making process
    - Looking first for a perfect match in the available research evidence (to support an instrumental use) and then looking more broadly (to support a conceptual use)
- To develop skills in
    - Identifying implementation considerations
    - Sharing your current approach to a health-system challenge
    - Commissioning research to fill gaps in research evidence

Key Resources for this Session

- Third box in the summary sheet

Questions to Consider

1. Where are the potential barriers to (and facilitators of) the successful implementation of an option? Are they at the level of
    o Patients / citizens (see question 2)
    o Health workers (see question 3)
    o Organizations (see question 4)
    o System (see question 5)
2. What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary behavioural changes among patients / citizens?
3. What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary behavioural changes among health workers?
4. What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary organizational changes?
5. What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary system changes?

Q1: Where are the Potential Barriers (and Facilitators)?

- Identify the level(s) where there are potential barriers to (and facilitators of) the successful implementation of an option
    - Patients / citizens (e.g., awareness of the availability of a free program)
    - Health workers (e.g., adherence to guidelines)
    - Organizations (e.g., performance management to ensure the delivery of high-quality care)
    - System (e.g., enforcement of regulations)

Q1: Where are the Potential Barriers (and Facilitators)?

- Identify the level(s) where there are potential barriers to (and facilitators of) the successful implementation of one of your options option, using the task sheet (#6)

Q2: Strategies for Patients/Citizens

- **What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary behavioural changes among patients / citizens?**
    - Information or education provision
    - Behaviour change support
    - Skills and competencies development
    - (Personal) Support
    - Communication and decision-making facilitation
    - System participation

Q3: Strategies for Health Workers

- **What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary behavioural changes among health workers?**
  - ❑ Educational materials
  - ❑ Educational meetings
  - ❑ Educational outreach visits
  - ❑ Local opinion leaders
  - ❑ Local consensus processes
  - ❑ Peer review
  - ❑ Audit and feedback
  - ❑ Reminders and prompts
  - ❑ Tailored interventions
  - ❑ Patient-mediated interventions
  - ❑ Multifaceted interventions

Q3: Strategies for Health Workers (2)

- **What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary behavioural changes among health workers?**
  - ❑ Educational materials
    - e.g., median effect across seven randomized controlled trials: +2.0% absolute improvement in professional practice outcomes (high-quality Cochrane review by Giguère et al. 2012)
  - ❑ Audit and feedback
    - e.g., median effect across studies: average +4.3% absolute improvement but more than 16% absolute improvement is observed when baseline performance is low and / or when key intervention features are incorporated (high-quality Cochrane review by Ivers et al. 2012)

Q4: Strategies for Organizations

- **What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary organizational changes?**
  - How can we understand complexity, interdependence and fragmentation?
    - Content, context and process model
    - Five whys
    - Process modelling — theory of constraints
  - Why do we need to change?
    - SWOT (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) analysis
  - Who and what can change?
    - Total quality management
    - Business process re-engineering
  - How can we make change happen?
    - Learning organization
    - Action research

Q5: Strategies for the System

- **What strategies should be considered in order to facilitate the necessary system changes?**
    - ❑ Governance arrangements
    - ❑ Financial arrangements
    - ❑ Delivery arrangements

Research Evidence can Help to Respond to the First Question

- **Where are the potential barriers to (and facilitators of) the successful implementation of an option?**

  - Research findings from qualitative studies that address the meanings and importance that individuals or groups attach to potential barriers and facilitators

Research Evidence can Help to Respond to the Questions about Strategies

- **What benefits are important to those who will be affected and which benefits are likely to be achieved with any given strategy?**
  - ❑ Systematic reviews of effectiveness studies (e.g., randomized controlled trials)
- **What harms are important to those who will be affected and which harms are likely to arise with the strategy?**
  - ❑ Systematic reviews of effectiveness or observational studies
- **What are the local costs of the strategy and is there local evidence about their cost-effectiveness?**
  - ❑ Local cost-effectiveness analysis
- **What adaptations might be made to the strategy and might they alter its benefits, harms and costs?**
  - ❑ Systematic reviews of qualitative studies (process evaluations)
- **Which stakeholders' views and experiences might influence the acceptability of the strategy and its benefits, harms, and costs?**
  - ❑ Systematic reviews of qualitative studies (e.g., acceptability studies)

13

Appropriate Sources of Research Evidence to Respond to the Questions

- **Where are the potential barriers to (and facilitators of) the successful implementation of an option? (question 1)**
  - ❑ PubMed 'hedge' (i.e., validated search strategy) can help here
    - Qualitative research
  - ❑ A Health System Evidence document type can help to identify systematic reviews if the barriers or facilitators involve health system arrangements
    - Systematic reviews addressing other questions

14

Appropriate Sources of Research Evidence to Respond to the Questions (2)

- **What are the benefits, harms, cost-effectiveness, etc. of potential implementation strategies? (questions 2-5)**
  - Health Systems Evidence
    - Systematic reviews of effects (question 2 – benefits, and possibly question 3 - harms)
    - Systematic reviews addressing other questions (question 3 – harms, question 5 – process evaluations, and question 6 – acceptability studies)
    - Economic evaluations (question 4 – cost effectiveness)

Summing Up

- **Identifying implementation considerations involves**
  - Brainstorming about (and searching for local data and research evidence about) potential barriers to (and facilitators of) the successful implementation of an option (question 1)
  - Searching Health Systems Evidence for research evidence about each potential strategy in turn
    - Benefits (question 2)
    - Harms (question 3)
    - Cost-effectiveness (question 4)
    - Adaptations (question 5)
    - Stakeholders' views and experiences (question 6)
  - Iteratively calibrating the strategies in light of the research evidence found

Over to You

- Share your current approach to a health-system challenge using the following prompts (using the slide template provided)
  - ❑ Names, roles and organizations
  - ❑ Problem and its causes
  - ❑ Options under consideration to address the problem
  - ❑ A few barriers or facilitators to one option under consideration
  - ❑ Brief description of the quality, applicability and key take-home message from a relevant systematic review that helps to clarify the problem, frame options or identify implementation considerations
  - ❑ Brief description of one example of the type of patient-oriented research you still need to clarify the problem, frame options or identify implementation considerations
    - E.g., a qualitative study or a systematic review of qualitative studies that address patients' and families' views about and experiences with the problem
    - E.g., a systematic review of effectiveness studies that examine patient-important outcomes
    - E.g., a qualitative study or a systematic review of qualitative studies that address potential barriers to an option at the level of patients and families